



# RESEARCH REPORT

## Program to Promote Economic Growth and Development for the Bedouin Population in the South of Israel

(Government Resolution 3708)

### First Report

Hagit Sofer Furman ✦ Yonatan Eyal ✦ Suzan Hassan-Daher ✦ Moria Frankel

The study was commissioned by the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development

**Program to Promote Economic Growth and Development  
for the Bedouin Population in the South of Israel**  
(Government Resolution 3708)  
**First Report**

Hagit Sofer Furman  
Suzan Hassan-Daher

Yonatan Eyal  
Moria Frankel

The study was commissioned by the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development

Jerusalem

August 2016

Editor: Anat Berberian

English translation (executive summary): Naomi Halsted

Layout and print production: Leslie Klineman

**Myers-JDC-Brookdale Institute**

P.O.B. 3886

Jerusalem 9103702, Israel

Tel: (02) 655-7400

Fax: (02) 561-2391

Website: <http://brookdale.jdc.org.il/>

e-mail: [brook@jdc.org.il](mailto:brook@jdc.org.il)



## Related Myers-JDC-Brookdale Institute Publications

Hassan-Daher, S. 2012. *Promoting and Developing Business Entrepreneurship among Bedouin Women in the Negev*. RR-624-12 (Hebrew, available on the Institute website only).

King, J. and Raanan, R. 2011. *Maavarim (Transitions): Rural Employment Center in the Bedouin Sector in the Negev – Khura and Segev Shalom Evaluation Report*. RR-591-11 (Hebrew).

To order publications, please contact the Myers-JDC-Brookdale Institute, P.O.B. 3886, Jerusalem, 9103702; Tel: (02) 655-7400; Fax: (02) 561-2391; E-mail: [brook@jdc.org.il](mailto:brook@jdc.org.il)

Reports and English summaries are also available on the Institute website: <http://brookdale.jdc.org.il>

# Executive Summary

## 1. Background

In 2014, the Bedouin population in the Negev was 230,900 – 2.7% of the population of Israel. Seventy-six percent of them were living in "recognized" localities and 24% in "unrecognized" villages.<sup>1</sup> The recognized localities include the town of Rahat, six local councils (Laqye, Tel Sheva, Segev-Shalom, Hura, Arara–Negev and Kuseife), and two regional councils (al-Kasom and Neve Midbar).

The Bedouin population in the Negev is one of the weakest populations in the country. In addition to its location in the periphery, it suffers from social and economic marginalization, as evidenced by the socioeconomic grade of the recognized localities, which are in the lowest cluster (1-2), and by the matriculation eligibility and employment rates, and the average wage, which are significantly lower than the equivalent data for the total population.

## 2. Government Resolution 3708

On September 11, 2011, the government passed Resolution 3708, concerning the program to promote economic growth and development for the Bedouin population in the Negev. The Bureau for the Settlement and Economic Development of the Bedouin Sector in the Negev, which was at the time in the Prime Minister's Office, was given responsibility for supervising and monitoring the implementation of the development program. Following government Resolution 1146 of January 5, 2014, responsibility for socioeconomic development and the status of Bedouin settlement in the Negev was transferred to the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development (MARD) and a program to integrate the Bedouin population in the Negev was initiated by the Planning Authority, which is the funding agency for monitoring and supervising implementation of the development program.

Resolution 3708 presents a five-year plan for 2012-2016 with the following goals:

1. To promote the economic status of the Bedouin population in the Negev
2. To strengthen the Bedouin local authorities
3. To strengthen the social life, communities and leadership in the Bedouin population.

In order to achieve these goals, it was decided to focus investment on women and young adults, particularly in the areas of employment and education. The resolution addressed the following five areas:

1. Raising the employment rate of the Bedouin population in the Negev, diversifying the places of employment, and increasing the integration of the Bedouin in employment in the Israeli economy
2. Developing infrastructures, particularly those that support employment, education, and society

---

<sup>1</sup> Central Bureau of Statistics, "Localities and Populations in Israel: 2014," Media Release, October 21, 2015. The population figure is for the entire Muslim population in the Southern District.

3. Strengthening personal security
4. Promoting education among the Bedouin in the Negev in order to increase their participation in the labor market
5. Strengthening and developing social life within the community and leadership in the villages, and expanding social services.

Several ministries were involved in implementation of the resolution: Economy, Education, Social Affairs and Services (MOSAS), MARD, Interior, Public Security, Defense (Security-Social Division), Transport and Road Safety, Culture and Sport, Development of the Negev and the Galilee, and Health.

The total budget for implementation of the resolution is NIS 1.2633 billion, of which 68% is a supplementary sum (not taken from the budgets of the ministries).

### 3. The Study on Government Resolution 3708

Clause 11 of Resolution 3708 stipulates that the program will be examined by an evaluation study. MARD commissioned the Myers-JDC-Brookdale Institute (MJB) to examine the implementation of the resolution and its outcomes over a 3-year period. The evaluation began in August 2014.

Together with the Planning Authority, it was decided that the study would focus on the four core areas listed below. This decision was due to their importance to the development and advancement of the Bedouin population and in light of the sizeable proportion of the budget earmarked for them – 77% of the total budget allocated for the resolution.

- ◆ ***Increasing the employment rate:*** Raising the employment rate while diversifying places of employment and increasing the integration of employees into the Israeli economy – setting up and administering employment centers; developing industrial parks; providing incentives to employers; offering professional training; and expanding activities to encourage business entrepreneurship.
- ◆ ***Developing infrastructures with an emphasis on those that support employment, education and society:*** Improving access to transportation to institutions of education and places of employment; developing childcare facilities.
- ◆ ***Strengthening personal security in the localities:*** Focusing on crime, drugs, investigations, traffic, youth, etc., including reinforcing activity to prevent violence and incidence of risk, and action to strengthen volunteer schemes in the locality.
- ◆ ***Promoting education in order to support employment:*** Tailoring programs to improve scholastic achievements; upgrading science and technology education systems; strengthening outstanding students and promoting excellence; providing career-oriented education; offering programs for participants to complete their education; constructing preschool and school classrooms; developing informal education; and implementing a program for disengaged youth to complete their education.

This, the first report, examines the implementation and outcomes of three of the core areas: employment, development of employment-supporting infrastructures and strengthening of personal security. This report presents data that were available in July 2015. The second report, to be published later in 2016, will focus on the core area of education to support employment. The third, summary, report will be published in 2017 and will update the data.

The study has two main goals:

1. ***To examine implementation of the resolution:*** To review the activities conducted in each of the core areas selected, present the implementation outputs, and identify successes and challenges
2. ***To examine the outcomes of the resolution:*** To present the findings about changes in the various areas, such as employment, wage and income data.

Information for the study was gathered from several complementary sources: In-depth interviews with representatives of organizations from various circles (program management, government ministries, Bedouin authorities, areas addressed in the program, and civil society); site visits to get to know the areas included in the study; attendance at key meetings; data from administrative sources; data from the Central Bureau of Statistics (CBS); documents and presentations.

## 4. Study Findings, by Area

The study findings are presented below by core area, as indicated above. The order in which they are presented (including the activities) is that in which they appear in Resolution 3708. In each area, we present the main achievements, the main challenges, and programmatic directions to address the challenges, based on the study findings. As noted, the report presents data that were available in July 2015.

### 4.1 Increasing the Employment Rate while Diversifying Places of Work and Increasing the Integration of Employees in the Israeli Economy

#### 4.1.1 *Setting up and Running Employment Centers in the Localities and Continuing to Run Regional Employment Centers*

##### **Achievements**

One of the meaningful positive implications of Resolution 3708 is reflected in the creation and running of the Riyan one-stop employment centers in the Negev. The program, which had already begun before the resolution was implemented, has been substantially expanded since then. The main achievements are as follows:

- ◆ Since the government resolution was passed, six one-stop employment centers have been set up – in Rahat, Arara, Laqye, Tel Sheva, Neve Midbar and al-Kasom – in addition to those in Hura and Segev-Shalom. The ninth center, in Kuseife, is expected to open shortly.
- ◆ Since implementation of the resolution began, the number of participants who have joined the program has doubled, from 1,523 in the three years prior to the resolution (2009-2011) to 3,075 in the three subsequent years (2012-2014). Fifty-six percent of the participants are women.

- ◆ 49% of the men and 32% of the women were placed in new jobs during their first year in the program. Most of those placed – 53% of the women and 90% of the men – were working full-time (35 hours per week) or more. Furthermore, 86% of the men and 66% of the women who were placed were still employed a year later.
- ◆ The program succeeded in maintaining positive employment outcomes even after it was expanded during implementation of the resolution: The employment rates of program participants from 2012-2014 were similar to those of participants from 2009-2011, before the resolution was implemented.

The program activities have some outstanding strengths:

- ◆ The recruitment and training of professional staff, most of them from the local population
- ◆ Initiation of tailored activities adapted to the cultural characteristics of the Bedouin population in order to encourage integration into employment, e.g., community activities, special professional training, employment fairs, forums of business people and community leaders
- ◆ Development of ties with large employers, creating a positive image for the program.

### Challenges

- ◆ Barriers impeding the integration of program participants into employment: Lack of basic employment resources such as Hebrew proficiency, work experience, work habits, and having a profession; opposition from some of the population to women working outside of their own locality; lack of flexibility among some of the women about the type of work; some of the women having to contend with multiple barriers; some of the population lack motivation and commitment to work.
- ◆ Lack of employment opportunities: Some of the Bedouin localities have no industrial parks nearby; most have only a few local businesses.
- ◆ Difficulties with employers: Difficulty marketing and implementing incentive programs for employers; some employers are prejudiced against Bedouin and attribute to Bedouin men characteristics such as irresponsibility and lack of job retention.
- ◆ Organizational difficulties that have to do with program staff and work practices: Difficulty recruiting staff for the program due to lack of suitable candidates, mainly in the areas of community and employers.
- ◆ Difficulties associated with professional training in the program: There are cases where it is hard to conduct the required professional training due to a lack of professional implementing organizations in or near the Bedouin localities in the south as well as difficulty in recruiting candidates for the training.
- ◆ Difficulties associated with the cultural characteristics of the Bedouin population: Some of the population have misgivings about the program and do not believe in its ability to help; some of the population objects to the community work to encourage the employment of women.



## Future Directions

- ◆ Increase cooperation between employers and program staff and encourage employers to hire program participants, e.g., by making the Ministry of Economy incentive program accessible and strengthening forums of employers within the program.
- ◆ Set up a mechanism to collect and consolidate data about the demands in the labor market in the south in order to ease the process of choosing professional training and increase the chance of placement for the participants after they have finished studying in these training programs.
- ◆ Increase services designed to cope with the barriers facing the program participants, e.g., for the women, increase the empowerment workshops and provide long-term one-on-one support, increase efforts to develop places of work within the localities and encourage small enterprises within the localities for women with multiple barriers. Among the men, it is recommended to develop interventions that encourage them to go out to work, impart good work habits and promote job retention.

### 4.1.2 Development of Industrial Parks

#### Achievements

Development of the Idan HaNegev industrial park shared by Rahat, the Bene Shimon regional council and the Lehavim local council began before implementation of Resolution 3708. The resolution guaranteed resources for the industrial park that enabled greater and faster progress in the development and marketing of lots throughout the northern section (approximately 500,000 square meters). As of April 2015, lots in the northern section, which were in various stages of development, had been marketed to some 50 entrepreneurs, about 65% of them Bedouin. A SodaStream factory had been set up in the industrial park and at the time of writing employed some 820 employees, a quarter of them Bedouin. It is expected to employ many more in the future.

Government Resolution 3708 also assured resources for developing smaller industrial parks. Despite various barriers, progress has been made in developing 75,000 square meters in the Abu Karinat industrial park and at the time of writing, the plots are being marketed. Progress has also been made at the Aruar industrial park – almost all the development work has been completed and lots have been marketed to some 20 local entrepreneurs. In the Segev-Shalom industrial park a survey of needs was conducted, which led to the revoking of some of the allocations to entrepreneurs who had not advanced their plans and for the first time a director was appointed for the industrial park. Detailed plans for Stage 1 and Stage 2 of the Bir Hadaj industrial park have been completed.

#### Challenges

- ◆ *Lack of commitment on the part of the entrepreneurs:* Entrepreneurs who have been allocated land in industrial parks often fail to meet the conditions of the agreement regarding the nature of the utilization of the land and/or the construction timetable. Furthermore, once an entrepreneur has paid any amount of money for a plot that has been allocated to him, even if he has not met his contractual obligations and the authorities have revoked the allocation, it is customary in

Bedouin society for no one else to make use of the plot. For this reason, it is difficult to market the plots to other entrepreneurs.

- ◆ **Ownership claims:** In the industrial parks under discussion, there are many cases where development is held up or even halted due to ownership disputes over the land or due to squatters.
- ◆ **Management of industrial parks:** Strong management is a meaningful factor in the success of an industrial park. Appointing an agent to manage an industrial park concentrates the entire administration of the park (including contact with the entrepreneurs, the council and the various authorities) in the hands of a single agency. For example, the management in Idan HaNegev can take determined action with problems that arise and can attract serious entrepreneurs to the park. In contrast, the authorities for the smaller industrial parks, such as Aruar (and more recently Segev-Shalom) do not have the funds to pay for a management agency. Consequently, obstacles, such as squatters and lack of commitment on the part of entrepreneurs, are not handled properly, which delays progress. In an effort to overcome this obstacle, a budget has been reallocated for a manager for the Segev-Shalom industrial park, who has recently taken up the position. However, the budget has been allocated for a period of only 3 years and is not sufficient to employ the workforce required to develop and strengthen the industrial park properly. The budget allocated for managing industrial parks in the Neve Midbar local council (Abu Karinat and Bir Hadaj) is also insufficient, since part of it has been reallocated to the industrial park in the El Kasom regional council (Umm Batin and al-Sayyid).
- ◆ **The shortage of professional and educated local manpower** makes it hard for employers in the industrial parks to recruit suitable staff.

#### **Future Directions**

- ◆ Given the difficulties managing the small industrial parks, we recommend examining the budget for management agents for these parks, including extending the period for which it is allocated, and continuing to promote the establishment of regional industrial parks for several localities, with preference for those that include Bedouin and Jewish localities, like Idan HaNegev.
- ◆ It is necessary to take a firm approach with entrepreneurs who do not meet their construction commitments so that progress can be made in the development of these zones.
- ◆ We recommend broadening professional training and higher education for Bedouin in professional areas that are in demand, in order to meet the current shortage of professional manpower in the area.

#### **4.1.3 Provision of Incentives to Employers through an Employment Track for the Bedouin Population**

##### **Achievements**

In 2012, an employment track to accept workers from populations with low participation rates in the workforce was updated: Several of its clauses have been specifically adapted for the employment of Bedouin in the Negev. Since the changes were made, there has been an increase in the number of Bedouin workers who have found work through the employment track. While during the years prior

to the resolution, there were only a few applicants, 102 Bedouin workers were hired through the track in 2012 and 242 began work in 2014.

### **Challenges**

The positive changes noted above are not felt among the representatives of the people working with the local employers (the Riyan-South centers and the Rahat branch of Maof). They argue that despite the efforts they are making to encourage employers to submit bids in the employment track, only few have done so, for the following reasons:

- ◆ *Uncertainty about the dates when the requests for bids will be published*, which makes it hard for the employers to plan the timing for recruitment and prevents them from submitting bids.
- ◆ *Submitting bids is arduous and time-consuming*: It involves completing forms and submitting various documents.
- ◆ To get the subsidy, ongoing reporting is required, and this is a nuisance for the employers.
- ◆ The investment center website does explain how to submit bids and includes FAQs about the process, but the explanations are in Hebrew only.

### **Future Directions**

In order to continue to encourage the employment of Bedouin through the employment track, we recommend examining the following:

- ◆ Eliminating uncertainty for employers by publishing the dates for the allocations in advance
- ◆ Expanding the economic areas for which there are subsidies and giving priority to areas in which the Bedouin are under-represented
- ◆ Prioritizing employers who provide their employees with training for professions for which there is a demand in Israel
- ◆ Simplifying the forms for submitting bids and long-term reporting
- ◆ Translating explanations about the employment track and submitting bids into Arabic, adding translations to the investment center website and disseminating them to the relevant parties.

#### **4.1.4 Professional Training for Adults**

##### **Achievements**

Following the above, after the resolution was passed, the Riyan program was extended to all the recognized Bedouin villages in the south apart from Kuseife. The professional training work of the Riyan centers is particularly important since for the first time there is an organization that focuses on professional training for the Bedouin population, with its distinctive characteristics. Riyan's work has a number of noteworthy aspects:

- ◆ Extensive distribution in the recognized Bedouin localities, including direct contact with the local population and understanding of its special culture

- ◆ Participants receives support from the moment they apply and inquire about training and placement in work
- ◆ Direct contact with the employers makes it possible to identify needs and opportunities for training
- ◆ The center offers a range of training models, including business courses, training in cooperation with the employer, and vouchers.

## Challenges

- ◆ ***Predicting the demand for professions in the training:*** The forecast is currently made by various agencies, such as the Ministry of Economy and the Riyan Centers, based on the information available to them from the Employment Service, industrial parks, and from surveys of training programs graduates that are conducted by the research administration at the Ministry of Economy. These agencies do not have a built-in periodical forecast that is agreed upon by all stakeholders. This difficulty is characteristic of all training systems in Israel.
- ◆ ***The voucher program:*** The program has advantages in that the training is individually adapted to each participant and provides an incentive to work in the area for which the participant has trained, once studies have been completed. The applicant and the referring organization have to conduct the process of applying for a voucher through MGAR Ltd. This process involves filling out forms and providing information and it is time consuming. For some of the applicants, the process itself is a barrier to participation in training.
- ◆ ***Recognition by the Ministry of Economy:*** The Division for Professional Training has a list of recognized curricula including those that provide a course completion certificate and sometimes a professional certificate or license. This is beneficial at the stage when the graduates are looking for a job. The training programs recognized by the division are limited to the list of suppliers and curricula that won the tender issued by the division five years ago. In cases where Riyan is interested in developing a new program, the organization has to apply to the division for recognition, a process that requires it to wait before the requested training program can be opened.
- ◆ ***Training in partnership with the employers:*** The training programs that work in partnership with the employers require the latter to hire workers after the training and to meet the requirements of filling out forms and reporting to the Ministry of Economy. The guarantee to hire staff and the time needed for the work required by the ministry discourage some employers from participating in the program.
- ◆ ***Living allowance for participants during the training:*** It is difficult for participants who are not eligible for any form of benefit (e.g., unemployment benefit or income support) during the training to make ends meet. This difficulty may be why people prefer to work and not participate in professional training, even though this should considerably improve their employment expectancy and their wage level in the long term. This problem affects all training schemes in Israel.

## Future Directions

- ◆ **Support for participants during training:** We recommend examining the possibility of broadening the system of grants for training participants and/or setting up a subsistence loan fund with comfortable terms during their studies.
- ◆ **Subsidies for employers:** We recommend examining the possibility of establishing a connection between the training participants and providing subsidies to the employer who will employ a training course graduate.

### 4.1.5 Practical Engineering Studies

#### Achievements

Having acquired experience from implementing the previous model in which practical engineering studies were conducted separately for the Bedouin population, it was decided as of 2013 to implement the Ashbal model (horizon for the integration of Bedouin into employment) in which the Bedouin students attend "regular" (not separate) classes and receive financial and individual support. In May 2015, there were 97 students in the program, 32% of them women, and the absolute majority were at the technological college in Beersheva. The short time that Ashbal has been implemented does not allow us at this stage to evaluate the outcomes of the program

#### Challenges

- ◆ **Social barriers:** The gaps between the society in which the Bedouin students have grown up and live and the demands of studies at college have a significant impact on their chances of success. The respondents raised a number of points in interview discussions:
  - **Adapting to college life:** There is an inherent difficulty with the encounter with a new society and framework. The students have to contend with difficulties in areas ranging from comportment in interpersonal relationships (men and women, for example), through studying in heterogeneous classes that include Jewish students, to conducting themselves with lecturers and administrators at the college.
  - **Difficulties of female Bedouin students:** Female Bedouin students have additional pressure in adapting to an environment where there are different rules of behavior in all aspects of their conduct as women and relationships with the opposite sex. Some female students leave college early before their classes are over so that they can get home in daylight.
- ◆ **Low level of basic knowledge:** A significant proportion of Bedouin students have a very low level of knowledge that does not meet the academic requirements. The respondents noted in particular the difficulty with Hebrew, especially for the women. The difficulty is felt in speaking as well as reading and writing.
- ◆ **Study habits:** The Bedouin students have not acquired appropriate study habits for the demanding studies at college. This is reflected, for example, in the lack of time devoted to homework and in the difficulty preparing for exams.

- ◆ **Difficulties integrating into the labor market:** Bedouin graduates have difficulty integrating into the labor market in their professions, partly because of exclusion and discrimination in the labor market.
- ◆ **Transportation:** Some of the students live in villages that are far from regular public transport, making it hard for them to get to their classes.
- ◆ **High school graduate candidates:** The admission track for practical engineering and technical colleges is adapted for candidates with full or partial matriculation exams. Candidates who apply to the colleges during twelfth grade have an inherent difficulty in that at the time of application, they do not yet have their matriculation certificate. This makes it difficult for Bedouin candidates to apply in time and to reserve themselves a place in the classrooms, particularly in professions that are in demand.

### Future Directions

The following are possible future directions for the Ashbal project.

- ◆ **Registering at the end of 12th grade:** As noted, it is sometimes difficult to register during twelfth grade because the candidates cannot provide matriculation grades at the time of application. A possible solution could be to set up a study scheme for a practical engineering degree for students in thirteenth and fourteenth grades in Bedouin localities in the south.
- ◆ **Incentives for employees:** An incentive scheme for employers to employ graduates of the training tracks in the Bedouin sector, including practical engineering studies.

#### 4.1.6 Business Entrepreneurship

The government resolution guaranteed budgets to promote business entrepreneurship in the Bedouin population, but due to the replacement of the implementing organization that occurred during this time (2014), activity has been reduced. However in the first half of 2015, activity was resumed and further expansion is expected shortly.

### Achievements

- ◆ After Maof was awarded the contract for the Small and Medium Businesses Agency, it opened a branch in Rahat, which replaced the branch of the Mati Business Development Center in the town. New employees were recruited and the package of tools offered to applicants was substantially expanded. The government resolution has enabled the Hub business center to open in the future and it is expected to expand activities in this area.
- ◆ The resolution does not provide the budget for the SAWA program, but its work with Bedouin women in the south has been considerably expanded since the Small and Medium Businesses Agency joined as a funding partner (2011). For the Bedouin women, participation in the program raises the family income by an average of around NIS 2,000 per month, which exceeds the average budget invested in each woman. In addition, the program has indirect positive impacts: empowerment of the women and the introduction of work habits to the home.

## Challenges

- ◆ It is difficult to promote entrepreneurship among the population for several reasons:
  - The Bedouin are skeptical about the work of Maof, which is perceived to represent the government.
  - Local entrepreneurs perceive Maof as an organization that provides loans rather than consultancy and support. There is a lack of awareness among entrepreneurs of the extent to which consultancy can improve the capacity of their businesses.
  - The local population has difficulty paying for what does not appear to be a concrete service. This makes it hard to open courses that are conditional upon advance co-payment. In an effort to encourage the Bedouin population to participate in activities, Maof had made specific adjustments: Free consultation hours for entrepreneurs and low co-payments for the activities.
- ◆ *It is difficult for Bedouin entrepreneurs to get bank credit and loans guaranteed by the state:* The main reason for this stems from the applicant's banking history, the number of restricted accounts, the lack of reporting about work and the location of businesses in places for which there is no building permit.
- ◆ *Lack of commercial space and areas suitable for artisans and small industry in Bedouin localities:* The cost of rental in Rahat is very high and the industrial zone is crowded. The Idan HaNegev industrial park does not meet the needs of artisans and small industry. In other industrial parks, there are barriers to using the land due to ownership claims or entrepreneurs who do not meet their obligation to set up their enterprises.
- ◆ *Lack of opportunities for the local market and difficulty penetrating new markets due to geographic and social periphery:* The Maof branch is taking action in this area: Setting up a business forum and an attempt to connect businesses to extensive projects such as IDF's relocation to the Negev and Digital Israel.
- ◆ Specific characteristics of business initiative activity among women:
  - *Social structure:* Bedouin society is patriarchal and women traditionally stay close to home. In order for women to participate in business activities, they have to get the approval of their husbands or other men in the family.
  - *Fear of losing benefits:* Women need to register their small businesses with the tax authorities as *ossek morshe* (licensed dealer) or *ossek pator* (exempt dealer) in order to expand them. If their families are eligible for income support benefits, they are afraid that the family will lose its eligibility forever and prefer not to register. This poses a barrier to developing their businesses.
  - *Childcare arrangements:* Business activity for women is dependent upon the supply of childcare facilities. In some of the localities, there are no facilities and in others, they operate for a limited number of hours.

## Future Directions

- ◆ Due to the difficulties Bedouin entrepreneurs have when seeking loans, we propose establishing a loan fund suited to the characteristics and needs of the Bedouin population.
- ◆ Due to the difficulty penetrating new markets, we propose increasing the assistance given to local entrepreneurs in marketing their products and penetrating new markets.
- ◆ We propose increasing childcare arrangements, including afternoon programs in order to allow the women greater economic activity.
- ◆ It is important that every process to advance business entrepreneurship for women considers the family as a whole and involves the men as well – advancing the women alone may undermine the fabric of family relationships and end up by weakening the women.

## 4.2 Developing Infrastructures, Particularly those that Support Employment, Education and Society

### 4.2.1 Improving Public Transportation to Academic Institutions and Places of Employment

#### Achievements

Since 2009, public transportation has served the Bedouin localities with intercity routes and urban routes operating in Rahat. Since the passing of the government resolution, some of the existing routes have been augmented and new routes added, including those to centers of employment and education. That these changes have improved access is evident in the extent to which public transportation is utilized. In Rahat, for example, almost 10,000 journeys are made every weekday; the number of students at Sapir and Achva Colleges is noticeably higher now than the number prior to the introduction of public transportation. The Ministry of Transport reports an increase in the volume of passengers on the existing routes and increased demand for additional routes. The residents are utilizing unregistered means of transportation less often and they are losing legitimacy. Developing public transportation is of the utmost importance for women: while irregular travel is seen as a threat to women's modesty, travel on public transportation routes is acceptable and opens up new possibilities for them.

#### Challenges

- ◆ **Land ownership claims:** Some transportation projects do not come to fruition or are delayed or require changes to the planning because of disputes over land ownership, which prevent use of the land for such projects.
- ◆ **Incomplete infrastructures in the localities:** The Ministry of Transport operates bus routes only where the infrastructure is good enough for the buses to pass. However, there are difficulties completing the infrastructure for several reasons: Land ownership issues, lack of awareness in some of the councils about the importance of infrastructure, lack of agreement among the residents as to where the bus stops should be placed, and internal disputes among residents. Due to the lack of infrastructure, there is no public transportation in most of the villages in the Neve Midbar and al-Kasom councils, which limits accessibility to places of employment and academic institutions for inhabitants of these villages.



- ◆ **Violence and vandalism:** There is a high incidence of stone throwing against buses and passenger threats and violence towards the drivers, as well as theft of equipment and damage to property at the bus stops and inside the buses.
- ◆ Contact with the Ministry of Transport:
  - **Fewer requests from the population:** The Bedouin population contacts the Ministry less than other population groups. This is apparently due to lack of awareness of the possibility of contacting the ministry and the fact that the Ministry website does not support requests from the public in Arabic.
  - **Members of council staff are unfamiliar with the procedures for contacting the ministry:** Officials in the Bedouin local authorities tend to send requests to the Ministry of Transport via the public complaints office instead of making direct contact with the appropriate officials. This tendency is presumably because they do not know the correct way to work with the ministry. In this context, note that the Public Transportation Authority has produced guidelines for requests about public transportation for municipal workers, which has been translated into Arabic. Furthermore, this year the Ministry of Transport has, for the first time, opened a course for representatives of Arab local councils aimed at working together more efficiently.
- ◆ **Lack of regulation of unregistered transport:** Despite the fact that there is public transportation in Rahat, unauthorized means of transport are still available. These vehicles work without permits, are not subsidized, do not meet safety criteria and do not have arrangements such as bus stops and signage. Furthermore, these vehicles impede the correct functioning of public bus routes and the amount of passengers using them.
- ◆ **Lack of official bus stops for the Bedouin diaspora:** Inhabitants of the unrecognized villages ask the bus drivers to stop at unofficial bus stops close to their homes, but the drivers cannot do so for safety reasons. This situation is liable to incur violent reactions from the frustrated passengers who have to get off the bus at stops that are a long way from their homes.

## Future Directions

- ◆ Despite the considerable progress that has been made, it is recommended that efforts continue to improve public transportation services in Bedouin localities in order to respond to the needs of the population. The need is particularly noticeable in the villages in the Neve Midbar and al-Kasom regional councils, most of which still do not have the infrastructure for buses to enter them. In Bedouin localities where there is a broad geographic spread and a large population (other than Rahat), it is necessary to regulate urban (internal) public transportation.
- ◆ **Extending public transportation routes** to reach additional potential places of employment
- ◆ **Investment in infrastructures:** Due to the numerous cases of vandalism at bus stops, it is worth considering installing reinforced stops (e.g., concrete) particularly in centrally located stops at which passengers get on the buses. We recommend investing in bus shelters in places where at present only a pole marks the bus stop; building bus terminuses within the localities so that all the buses can turn around safely and in accordance with regulations; increasing the number of

bus stops and the underground passages allowing them to be used on main roads for Bedouin in the diaspora; building a night parking lot for vehicles in Rahat to prevent trucks from parking in the city, which is a safety hazard and blocks public transportation routes.

- ◆ ***We recommend regulating unauthorized transportation*** so that these vehicles do not impede proper functioning of the public bus routes in Rahat and other localities.
- ◆ We recommend that representatives from all the Bedouin local authorities participate in an ***introductory course to the Ministry of Transport*** to improve work with the ministry.

## 4.2.2 Childcare Arrangements

### Achievements

In the past two years, efforts have been made to establish facilities for children in Bedouin localities in the south in order to increase the number of children enrolled in them. Since implementation of the resolution, one more daycare center has opened and there has been an increase in the total number of children admitted to facilities under the auspices of the Ministry of Economy. However, the main population served is children in the care of social services, whose parents are not necessarily working.

### Challenges

- ◆ ***The lack of daycare centers and afternoon programs in Bedouin localities*** is particularly difficult for women working in full-time employment who are unable to find arrangements for their children during the afternoon hours. There are several reasons for this difficulty:
  - Due to budget limitations, the Ministry of Economy has stopped expanding home-based childcare services throughout the country.
  - Difficulties that have to do with the local authorities: The local authorities have no interest in opening facilities because of the financial cost involved and the inability to make the co-payments for children in the care of social services; lack of knowledge about how to submit requests to open up a childcare facility; lack of awareness of the importance of doing so.
  - Parents tend to prefer to send their children to private or informal facilities, partly due to transportation difficulties within the localities.
  - There is a shortage of professionals able to establish and run facilities for children.
  - There is a shortage of homes that meet the required standards for home-based childcare services.
- ◆ ***Difficulties with the implementation and supervision of facilities***
  - There is a limited selection of facilities subsidized by the Ministry of Economy.
  - Many families have difficulty paying the full amount required by the daycare centers or home-based childcare services.
  - There are difficulties with the caregivers' wages: The monthly wages are low and based mainly on government subsidy; there are cases where local authorities with financial problems withhold payment.

- It is hard to recruit local coordinators for the local home-based childcare services who have the job of supervising the work of the services within the locality.
- The difficulty of physical access to Bedouin villages makes it hard to carry out inspections of the home-based childcare services particularly in the Neve Midbar and al-Kasom regional councils.
- Difficulties of family commitment:
  - Members of rival clans do not use daycare facilities located in areas dominated by their rivals or facilities belonging to their rivals.
  - There is a tendency for neither the service coordinators recruited from within the community, nor the parents, to report problems or accidents that occur in daycare centers to the authorities.

### **Future Directions**

- ◆ We recommend steps be taken to encourage individuals, organizations, and nonprofits working in the field of daycare facilities for children to apply to open daycare centers in Bedouin localities.
- ◆ We recommend that the Ministry of Economy increase its work with the Bedouin local authorities to promote applications to open facilities, and to recruit and train a good team of coordinators and caregivers.
- ◆ We recommend action to increase the number of children of working parents enrolled in facilities under the auspices of the Ministry of Economy.

## **4.3 Strengthening the Personal Safety of Residents**

### **4.3.1 Israel Police**

#### **Achievements**

Since implementation of the resolution, the number of approved positions in police stations in the townships has increased from 108 to 182. There has also been a change in the deployment of the forces, which included the creation of three police posts in place of the task forces that had operated previously to provide ongoing policing services to the population. In addition, there are currently 7 community policing commanders in the area of the township police.

With regard to the data on the work of the township police and Rahat police, from 2012-2015 there was a notable increase in the number of bills of indictment served (57% from the township police and 21% from Rahat, compared with 14% in the rest of the district). The increase is particularly evident in the township police. There was also an increase in the number of bills of indictment served for domestic violence. Apparently, this rise is due to a staffing increase in the township police and the increase in public confidence in the police, which have led to an increase in the volume of complaints. Furthermore, it is reasonable to assume that the stationing of a social worker from the City Without Violence program at Rahat police station, albeit for a limited time, has increased the willingness of women to submit complaints.

Wishing to strengthen the relationship with the community in general and particularly with the youth, the township police is working with youth in several areas: Creating youth movements for a group of adolescents in every locality; offering lectures about drug abuse and the prevention of violence, and developing a program for youth at risk.

## Challenges

- ◆ ***Working with the Bedouin population:*** As part of the establishment, the police has to cope with a complex situation that creates a lack of confidence among the Bedouin and leads to difficulties working with the population:
  - The lack of settlement of land issues and the demolition of illegally built structures has generated anger among the population. The Yoav police unit assists in enforcing the land laws and the Planning and Construction Act, which leads the residents to make a connection between policy activity and these issues.
  - The Bedouin population suffers from a palpably greater lack of employment opportunities and transportation, education and health infrastructures than the rest of the population in Israel.
- ◆ ***Sense of security among the residents:*** The interviews conducted during the study revealed bitter feelings about police handling of issues relating to the personal safety of the residents. The following subjects were brought up in the interviews:
  - A sense that the police is not interested in the population's problems of personal safety unless it concerns home demolitions or hostile terrorist activity
  - The absence of police presence in the field and no rapid response to emergency calls
  - The volume of shootings and murders that are not dealt with appropriately
  - The police do not attend to offenses against the public, such as parking offenses or playing loud music.
- ◆ ***Multiple cases of violence on public transportation*** as described in the section on transportation, above.
- ◆ ***Use of weapons*** is commonplace among the populations as a means of solving disputes.
- ◆ ***Crime:*** Among the Bedouin, there are family-based gangs of criminals that commit crimes all over the country. In the past, the gangs were involved in drug smuggling, but the closure of the Egyptian border has made it hard for them to continue. Route 6 has made it easier for them to travel to the center of the country.
- ◆ ***Gunfire at weddings:*** This custom worries the population and may sometimes cause injury or even death. In order to deal with the problem, the community police officer talks with the bridegroom and his father before the wedding and has them sign an assurance that there will be no gunfire at the wedding. If shots are fired, a file is opened at the police.

- ◆ **Road traffic accidents:** Road traffic accidents are commonplace, including those that occur close to people's homes, in their yards and entrances to their homes. Some of the accidents are due to lack of proper infrastructure on the roads and some are due to careless driving.
- ◆ **Recruiting Bedouin police officers:** At the township station and at the Rahat station there are only a few Bedouin officers. The respondents noted that this lack of Bedouin representation is due both to the difficulty Bedouin candidates have in passing the screening for the police and from the reluctance of Bedouin to join the police, which sometimes involves taking action against the population in tense and sensitive situations. This lack of Bedouin police officers makes it hard for the police to build confidence among the residents and enjoy their cooperation.

### 4.3.2 City without Violence

#### Achievements

The City Without Violence program strives to improve the ability of the authority to cope with various aspects of violence in five core areas: enforcement, education, welfare, leisure and community. The program had already been implemented in some of the Bedouin localities (Rahat, Segev-Shalom, Hura, Arara-Negev and Kuseife) prior to the government resolution and since then it has started implementation in Laqye, Tel Sheva and the al-Kasom and Neve Midbar regional councils. Among the program's main achievements:

- ◆ **Gunfire at weddings:** Work is being conducted with the police as described above. According to the respondents, the work has led to a significant decline in the incidence of gunfire at weddings.
- ◆ **Domestic violence:** There has been an increase in the number of complaints of domestic violence registered by women, as described above.
- ◆ **Good neighborliness:** The program is intended to introduce groups of Jewish and Bedouin youth in grades 9-10 who live in nearby localities. Four groups are currently conducting joint activities.
- ◆ **Security cameras:** Cameras have been set up around the localities particularly in "crime sensitive" areas and are connected to a CCTV center for monitoring and enforcement purposes. The installation of the cameras is very important for deterring and identifying criminals.
- ◆ **Safety advisors:** The advisors work in schools to promote a climate that prevents violence and antisocial behaviors. A national survey has found that school staffs are satisfied with the cooperation and functioning of the advisors.

#### Challenges

- ◆ **Program budget:** The budget for the program is conditional upon the size of the locality. For this reason, smaller localities receive considerably less funding, which makes it hard to conduct core activities. Furthermore, the requirement for copayments is a burden for the Bedouin authorities, which are ranked in the lowest socioeconomic clusters. In 2015, the regional councils were given a full budget for the program without the requirement of copayments.
- ◆ **Lack of infrastructures:** The program suffers from a lack of the municipal infrastructures required to conduct its activities, which obstructs the development of the model planned in the

locality. For example, there is a lack of public sport fields and insufficient electricity infrastructure to connect the cameras.

- ◆ *Appointment of officials:* When appointments are made for staff for the program in the localities, the pressure of nepotism hampers the appointment of the best person for the job.
- ◆ *The "nationalist" context:* Tensions between the Bedouin sector and the government hamper implementation of the project, which is entirely based on working in partnership with the community. As a result of this situation, the National Service program, which could have provided additional personnel for the program, is not implemented in Bedouin villages.
- ◆ *Joint policing* (a police officer and an inspector working together to respond to the needs of the residents): Although the program provides a budget for a patrol vehicle for joint policing, the vehicles do not always operate as planned. There are a number of reasons for this, including the unavailability of officers who could accompany the inspector on patrol. The program has 4 patrol vehicles in Rahat, Tel Sheva, Hura and Arara. The vehicle in Rahat operates on and off; the rest do not function at all.

### **4.3.3 The Israel Anti-Drug Authority**

#### **Achievements**

The Israel Anti-Drug Authority began work in Rahat before the government resolution was passed; it has been introduced into the other recognized localities since 2012, concurrent with implementation of the resolution. The authority employs one half-time coordinator in every locality, apart from Rahat, where the employee is full-time. The coordinator's job includes preventive and informative programs in the schools, informal education activities, liaison with social services, advertising and counseling. The main achievements were:

- ◆ Increasing the awareness and involvement of residents in the fight against drugs and alcohol abuse. For example, at Arara-Negev, the residents initiated a demonstration against drug abuse and alcohol consumption.
- ◆ Young leadership groups have been formed. The groups are headed by the coordinator and they help to transmit messages to other adolescents.

#### **Challenges**

- ◆ The funding for the coordinators is provided by the Israel Anti-Drug Authority and the local authorities add an additional 20% to this amount. The local authorities have difficulty paying their share of the funding.
- ◆ It is difficult to work with the residents on drugs and alcohol because of the inherent difficulty that the population has in talking openly about problems. Adolescent boys and girls need approval from their parents to attend meetings, which is a barrier and hampers the opening of new groups.

## 5. General Findings

The following is a summary of the preliminary findings of the outcomes of activity through Resolution 3708. The short time in which the resolution had been implemented at the time of the study (2012-2014) and the delay in publishing some of the data, make it difficult at this stage to discern changes in the measures since the start of implementation. All the findings apply to the population of recognized localities.

- ◆ In 2013, all the recognized Bedouin localities were ranked in the lowest socioeconomic clusters (1-2).
- ◆ The employment rate for Bedouin men is low. In 2014, it was 56% compared with 79% among Jewish men in the south. Among Bedouin women, it was 24% compared with 74% among Jewish women in the south.
- ◆ In 2014, the unemployment rate among Bedouin men was 13%, compared with 7% among Jewish men in the south.
- ◆ Among the Bedouin, the percentage of self-employed men out of all employed men was 3-4% in 2012 and was lower than the national average, which was 7%. Over time, there has been a definite steady decline in the percentage among all employed Bedouin.
- ◆ Among the Bedouin men there has been an increase over time in the rate of day workers (outside of their own locality) – from 27% of all workers in 2007 to 47% in 2014. The percentage of female day workers is higher and reached 73% in 2014.
- ◆ In 2013, the percentage of individuals receiving income support out of all residents ranged from 17% in Rahat to 35% in Laqye. From 2007-2013, there was a decline in the percentage of individuals receiving income support in all Bedouin localities apart from Laqye.
- ◆ From 2007-2012, there was an increase in the real average wage of women and men in Bedouin localities (apart from women in Hura). This trend indicates an increase in the residents' standard of living.
- ◆ The rate of individuals earning below the minimum wage is higher among the Bedouin than among the total population of wage earners in Israel. In 2012, it ranged from 47% to 57% in the different localities, compared to 38.4% among the total population of wage earners in Israel. No significant changes were seen in this measure over time.
- ◆ The income data for 2007-2012 show that in every authority apart from Segev-Shalom there was a real increase in the income of self-employed individuals over time, meaning an increase in the standard of living.
- ◆ In 2012, the percentage of self-employed individuals earning up to half the average wage ranged from 37% in Arara-Negev to 55% in Hura. Over time, no pattern of change was observed.

## 5.1 Major Topics that Arose during the Study

The following topics arose in various contexts and have a direct bearing on the best way to implement the resolution.

### *Land Ownership Claims*

Disputes over land ownership in Bedouin localities and action taken in that regard, including home demolitions, create tension between the local population and state authorities, making cooperation difficult. For example, identifying the police with home demolitions – an act that conflicts with the nature of the role of the police to provide a service to the population – is damaging to the population's confidence in the police and its willingness to seek assistance when needed. Furthermore, land ownership disputes significantly impede development of Bedouin localities. In the areas selected for the study, this is reflected in delays to the development of industrial parks and to installing infrastructures for transportation services in the localities, in a lack of commercial space, and in difficulty finding suitable areas for constructing public buildings.

### *Unrecognized Villages*

Government Resolution 3708 applies to recognized localities only, but the issue of unrecognized villages affects the entire Bedouin population in the south, including those in recognized localities. In the absence of services in the unrecognized villages, their residents depend on services provided in neighboring – recognized – localities. In practice, in many cases the volume of services provided to the recognized localities is not appropriate for the population, creating more pressure on the services in these localities. Hence, any thought to infrastructures and the volume of services in the recognized localities must take account of the fact that they serve a far greater population than the number of registered residents.

### *Lack of Infrastructures in the Recognized Localities*

The lack of physical infrastructure in the recognized localities impedes their social and economic development. For example, most of the localities in the Neve Midbar and al-Kasom regional councils lack the infrastructure to allow public transport to enter them and buses therefore stop on the main road outside the localities; Bedouin localities lack commercial areas suitable for small businesses; and there is a shortage of buildings that meet the standard requirements for public buildings ("form 4").

### *Unique Social Structure*

- ◆ *Status of women:* Bedouin society is traditional and patriarchal – men hold positions of power and make the decisions while the women's place is in the home and family unit. This is manifest in some men's objections or suspicions about the following: women going to work or study outside of their own locality; men and women working together; women expanding their small businesses outside the limits of their own home or village; women travelling on public transportation outside of daylight hours, etc. It is important that any steps taken to empower women in Bedouin society, including education, employment and entrepreneurship, consider the family as a whole and involve the men in the process as well. Any steps taken that focus on women alone are liable to undermine the fabric of the family unit and eventually disempower the women.



- ◆ ***Conflict resolution:*** In general, Bedouin society prefers to resolve internal conflicts using local traditional methods without involving the authorities. This preference is due to the population's lack of confidence in the police and other agencies representing the establishment, as noted above. However, in recent years, there has been an increasing trend to go to the police for certain matters, particularly Bedouin women registering domestic violence complaints against their husbands.
- ◆ ***Commitment to the tribe and extended family:*** Bedouin society is made up of tribes: A tribe is a unit made up of extended families – clans – and, in turn, the extended family is made up of nuclear families. The clan is the main family unit in Bedouin society and blood ties are stronger than any other bond. This bond has enormous influence over Bedouin life and is reflected in areas selected for the study in the following ways:
  - There is pressure on officials in local authorities and institutions to prefer relatives when appointing personnel or contractors for projects. For this reason, a number of officials noted that external appointments of personnel or contractors removes family pressure from them and enables them to appoint more professional staff.
  - Incidents that occur within the extended family and that require reporting to the authorities are not always reported, impeding the authorities' enforcement and inspection ability. For example, parents who send their children to home-based childcare services tend not to report accidents at the facility, which is generally run by a relative.
  - Family feuds affect the daily life in the locality in the following cases, for example:
    - i) Frequency of violent fights between the families, including shooting incidents and even murder
    - ii) Members of rival families often refrain from using public services and infrastructures located in parts of the locality under the control of the rival family or those where the service provider belongs to the rival family.
- ◆ ***Social structure as a resource:*** Bedouin social structure is also a powerful resource that can be used to the benefit of the population:
  - The Riyan program builds a "family network" of people with formal and informal influence in the community, which helps the centers to promote their areas of activity.
  - A number of programs contact religious leaders – the imams in the mosques – to enlist their help in conveying messages to the community during their Friday sermons. Among the topics that have been raised: Refraining from gunfire at weddings (City Without Violence) and abstaining from violence and vandalism in public places (Ministry of Transport and the implementing companies).
- ◆ ***Importance of involving the population and adapting services to its social structure:*** The points listed above illustrate the importance of adapting the services provided to the Bedouin to the social structure of the population and involving the population in decision-making on matters regarding the planning and implementation of these services. A good model for these processes can be seen at the Riyan centers, which have learned to recruit and foster a broad professional

staff from within the local population in all the Bedouin localities. The program uses the local community and social resources in order to recruit participants to the program and promote employment in the localities.

### *The Local Authorities*

The Bedouin local authorities contend with several difficulties that impair their ability to maximize the budgets from the government resolution:

- ◆ The Bedouin local authorities are at the bottom of the socioeconomic scale of local authorities in Israel. The limited budgets make it difficult to take advantage of programs that require matching funds from them, e.g., payments for daycare facilities for children.
- ◆ The Bedouin local authorities are not free to plan independently in the localities and they are dependent on the Bedouin Negev Development and Settlement Authority.
- ◆ Some council workers need to increase their knowledge about working with state authorities: They are unfamiliar with government resolutions concerning Bedouin localities; they are unfamiliar with the structure of government ministries and with the relevant officials with whom they have to work in order to obtain the budgets that are available to them.
- ◆ Pressure from family and social commitments: Local authority workers are under pressure to employ family members, which sometimes leads to the appointment of officials who lack the right skills; it is sometimes hard for them to do their duty when it means going against accepted Bedouin custom, e.g., land ownership claims or dealing with matters that concern family members.

# Table of Contents

1. Introduction	1
2. Study Method	1
2.1 Study Goals	1
2.2 Study Areas	2
2.3 Steering Committee	2
2.4 Sources of Information and Data	2
2.5 Products	4
2.6 Study Limitations	4
3. Background	5
4. Study Findings by Area	7
4.1 Raising the Employment Rate while Diversifying Places of Work and Increasing the Integration of Employees in the Israeli Economy	8
4.2 Developing Infrastructures, Particularly those that Support Employment, Education and Society	69
4.3 Strengthening the Personal Security of Residents in the Localities	93
5. General Findings	105
5.1 Socioeconomic Cluster	105
5.2 Employment	106
5.3 Income Support Beneficiaries	108
5.4 Wages of Wage-Earners	109
5.5 Income of the Self-Employed	111
6. Conclusion	111
6.1 Summary of the Achievements of Resolution 3708	111
6.2 Main Topics that Arose during the Study	114
List of Sources	119
<b>Appendices</b>	
Appendix I: Members of the Study Steering Committee Present at the First Meeting (January 15, 2015)	127
Appendix II: Government Resolutions and Programs Relevant to the Bedouin Population Concomitant with Resolution 3708	128
Appendix III: Table III-1: Bus Routes that Go into Bedouin Localities, including Daily and Weekly Timetables, 2010-2015	139